Under Muslim Rule

Reviewed by DANIEL PIPES

The history of Jews in Muslim countries conjures up two contradictory images in the Western mind: on the one hand, the glorious achievements of medieval Spain in poetry, philosophy, and science; on the other hand, the degradation of recent times—flight from Yemen, public hangings in Iraq, possible persecution in Khomeini’s Iran. Beyond these two extremes, the story of the Jews under Islam remains obscure. The standard histories of the Jews tend to slight all but the most exceptional events outside Europe, and anyway they display little understanding of the Islamic environment, in which Jews have lived for 1,850 years. Whereas historians are careful to explain developments in 11th- and 12th-century European Jewish life against the background of the Crusades, or the massive changes in the 19th-century intellectual world of Jews against the background of the European Enlightenment, Jewish life in Muslim countries too often has seemed an arbitrary sequence of events affected by random, inexplicable forces.

Norman A. Stillman has made a signal contribution by drawing in this book a general portrait of Jewish life among Muslims with clarity, intelligence, and a wide perspective. He treats his topic in two ways: the first quarter of The Jews of Arab Lands is a historical outline incorporating the latest research, including Stillman’s own. The rest of the book is devoted to a large and fascinating collection of documents and literary texts translated mostly from Arabic and Hebrew, but also from Aramaic, Persian, Turkish, and several European languages. The excellent translations and helpful footnotes give the English-speaking reader a genuine sense of the varieties of Jewish experience under Islam. (The word “Arab” in the book’s title is seriously misleading, however, since before the 20th century, “Arabic speakers from Iraq to Morocco” had virtually no sense of a common identity. Stillman deals with the Jews of Muslim lands in the Middle East and Mediterranean area, regardless of language.)

The historical section follows a scheme of periodization which derives closely from that established by Stillman’s teacher, S. D. Goitein. (It is a sad reflection on the state of scholarship about non-Western areas that this outline was originally created to understand the

---

Memoirs of War, 1914-1915
By MARC BLOCH. Translated, with an Introduction, by CAROLE FINK. In his Memoirs of War, 1914-1915, now translated into English for the first time, noted historian Marc Bloch left a keen and affecting account of his combat experience in World War I. Bloch served as an infantry sergeant during the war and kept a journal in which he vividly recorded his day-to-day life at the front. Illustrated with thirty evocative photographs, Bloch’s reminiscences starkly call forth the daily discomfort, dread, and impending death that faced every soldier. $15.00

The Middle East in World Affairs
Fourth Edition
By GEORGE LENCZOWSKI. Eighteen years have passed since the publication of the third edition of this book, and the material that Lenczowski has added in this fourth edition could alone make a new book. This is the single most comprehensive work on political, social, and economic developments in the Middle East from 1914 to the brink of the 1980’s. The author deals with the region as a whole and with the domestic and foreign affairs of seventeen states: Iran, Afghanistan, Turkey, Iraq, Syria, Lebanon, Israel, Jordan, Egypt, Saudi Arabia, Yemen, South Yemen, Kuwait, Bahrain, Qatar, Oman, and the United Arab Emirates. Of special interest is his analysis of that most perplexing 20th-century conflict, Arab versus Israeli nationalism. $14.95 paper; $29.50 cloth

Collaborationism in France during the Second World War
By BERTRAM M. GORDON. “Gordon has solidly researched his subject, tapping German as well as a multitude of French sources (including personal interviews), has organized his material in a very readable fashion, and writes beautifully. This will be the definitive work on a subject that has only been treated in a cursory manner by historians to date.” —Robert Soucy, Oberlin College. $19.50

CORNELL UNIVERSITY PRESS
P.O. Box 250, Ithaca, New York 14850

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
THEODORE H. WHITE hails
“a marvelous thriller.”*

*“THE SPIKE is a marvelous thriller
that races with adventure all
through the world of the foreign
correspondent—from Washington
to Paris, from Saigon to Hamburg,
from London to New York. Only
Arnaud de Borchgrave could pack
so much authentic experience
into so entertaining a story.”
—THEODORE H. WHITE

“A well-written, fast-paced novel
that deals with a challenge posed
to America and the Free World:
can the Soviets destroy the West
without firing a shot?”
—RICHARD HELMS, Former Direc-
tor of the C.I.A.

“THE SPIKE is so convincing that
it’s hard to tell where fact leaves off
and fiction begins.”
—OSBORN ELLIOTT, Dean, Columb-
ia University Graduate School
of Journalism

CROWN
$12.95, now at your bookstore

Many popular Jewish cus-
toms have their roots in
pagan cultures—but were
later transformed and re-
interpreted. This newly
revised classic by one of the
foremost authorities on
Semitic religion and com-
parative folklore traces the
origins and developments of
Jewish customs associated
with major events in life.
Charms for the protection
of the newborn; circum-
cision; marriage contracts;
dietary laws and burial
observances are among the
many folkways examined.

“Fascinating...enlightening.”—Kirkus Reviews

“Carefully documented. An unusual and interesting
work.”—Library Journal

Clothbound, $10.95
A Morrow Quill Paperback, $4.95

William Morrow
105 Madison Ave., N.Y., N.Y. 10016

past of the Jews.) The outline be-
gins with the brief but crucial pe-
riod of Muhammad’s prophecy
(610-62), when the Qur’an and
Muhammad’s actions set funda-
mental Muslim attitudes toward
Jews and other non-Muslims. A
dual heritage emerged, accepting
Judaism but antagonistic toward
Jews. Unlike Christianity, which
was always troubled by the contin-
ued existence of Judaism, Islam did
not have to convert the Jews but
granted them specific rights as
members of a monothestic, scrip-
tural religion. But it also despised
them for insisting on believing in a
defective version of God’s message.
Jews were not to be befriended or
trusted; rather, they were to be hu-
miliated as a reminder of the infe-
riority of their religion. In subse-
quent centuries, Muslims could jus-
tify benevolent or harsh treatment
of Jews by emphasizing one or the
other of these elements.

In the second period, 682 to
around 900, Jews from Iran to Spain
fell under Muslim control; they de-
veloped new cultural forms charac-
terized by an increasingly frequent
use of the Arabic idiom (Sa’ada
Gaon’s translation of the Bible in
the early 10th century had nearly
the impact of the Septuagint in
3rd-century B.C.E. Alexandria or
Moses Mendelssohn’s 18th-century
German translation), and lived in
conformity with the requirements
of their Muslim overlords. Most
significantly, “during this time
large numbers of Jews in the Is-
lamic East . . . gradually changed
over from the agrarian way of life
. . . to a more cosmopolitan one”;
they moved to the cities and hence-
forth derived most of their income
from trade and industry. Jews
played a major part in the “bour-
geois revolution” of the 8th and
9th centuries, leaving the manual
trades for commerce, banking,
manufacturing, and the profes-
sions.

The “best years,” 900-1200, coin-
cided with the centuries of greatest
Muslim wealth and cultural accom-
plishment. Iraqi leadership in Jew-
ish (as in Muslim) affairs ended
during this period, to be replaced
by the secure, rich community of
Egypt and the cultural brilliance of
North Africa and Spain. Spain produced some of the most illustrious figures of Jewish culture: the poets Solomon ibn Gabirol (d. 1070) and Judah ha-Levi (d. 1141), and the religious philosopher Moses Maimonides (d. 1204) are perhaps the best-known. Two factors help explain the vitality of Jewish culture in Spain and elsewhere during these centuries. First, Muslim wealth and creativity were then at their height and probably preeminent in all Eurasia, certainly surpassing the level of Christian Europe. Second, Jews living among Muslims participated in the mainstream culture. They hardly ever experienced the social and cultural isolation more commonly endured by their brethren living in Christian countries.

During the “best years,” Jews and Muslims could create a cultural symbiosis: a degree of toleration and shared concerns meant that they addressed similar issues from divergent viewpoints (in a manner resembling much of the intellectual life in the West today). Jews wrote in Arabic (except for poetry, which was almost always in Hebrew), considered the same moral, philosophic, and scientific questions as their Muslim counterparts, and lived under a legal system comparable to the Muslim one. Some persecution of Jews did occur during the period 900-1200, but “a relatively open society [existed] in which more often than not Muslims and non-Muslims could participate, if not on an entirely equal footing, at least with near equality in those spheres of activity that were not specifically religious, particularly in the marketplace, in certain scientific and intellectual circles, and, to an extent, in the civil service.” Islam is the only monotheistic religion that has allowed Jews to participate so fully in its culture. By contrast, in the European Enlightenment many centuries later, Christianity had to be removed as the central element of culture before Jews could join in a common discourse.

Stillman terms the fourth period, 1200-1850, “the long twilight” during which Jewish social standing and culture fell. As Crusaders, Christian Spaniards, and Mongols challenged the Muslims militarily, “the secular and humanistic tendencies of Hellenism, which until this period had been predominant cultural forces in Islamic society, began to wane [while] the Islamic religious element in its most rigid form began to wax ever stronger.” The unfortunate implication here, that it was Hellenism and not Islam that accounted for the earlier Muslim creativity and tolerance, recalls certain 19th-century efforts to ascribe everything good in Muslim culture to the Greeks. A more convincing explanation takes into account economic decay, a greater emphasis on legal prescriptions, the spread of mysticism, and cultural

“The great virtue and service of Sidra Ezrah’s By Words Alone

is that more than any other book I know on this literature, it helps us to see the terrible events that formed it. Although her book is essentially a literary history, and displays the kind of quiet judgment that literary history requires, Mrs. Ezrah makes us see the Holocaust itself as inevitably more real, urgent, terrible, than the writing that came out of it. That is as it should be. In the history of Jewish literature generally, the creation comes before the word and transcends it... To be a Jew is to know that words strive after the reality but can never adequately capture the human situation.”

—From the Foreword by Alfred Kazin

BY WORDS ALONE

The Holocaust in Literature

Sidra DeKoven Ezrah

$15.00

The University of CHICAGO Press  Chicago 60637
Less than Slaves
Benjamin B. Ferencz
Foreword by Telford Taylor
A sequel to Hitler's Holocaust, the story of Jewish forced labor. A New York Times Book Review Editors' Choice. $15.00

Brandeis of Boston
Allon Gal
This compelling biography of Louis D. Brandeis uncovers the social and psychological roots of his progressivism, ethnicity, and Zionism. $16.50

Gershom Scholem
Kabbalah and Counter-History
David Biale
Selected by The New York Times Book Review as one of the best books published in 1979. "In this brilliant and insightful study of the man, his life and works, his contributions to the understanding of Judaism in this age of secularism and nationalism, of religion caught short of spiritual components, David Biale has illuminated some of the essential issues for both Jewish and non-Jewish readers."—Robert Kirsch, Los Angeles Times $15.00

Harvard University Press
Cambridge, MA 02138

80/COMMENTARY MAY 1980

peans had hoped incidentally to improve the Jews' position in Muslim lands, but in the end they undermined it. Protected to some degree by religious precepts, Jews had fared better under Islamic law than they did in the newly independent Muslim states of the 20th century. The side-effects of European power—including such disparate and mutually contradictory phenomena as new legal systems, political anti-Semitism, the Alliance Israélite Universelle, and Zionism—worked to create less bearable circumstances, forcing the Jews to leave. One hopes that in a future volume Stillman will take up this modern history with the same intelligence and care he has devoted to earlier times.

Open Admissions Revised


Reviewed by Peter Shaw

In 1978 Theodore L. Gross, then a dean at the City College of New York, published an article in Saturday Review that raised a storm of protest over its criticisms of his campus's Open Admissions program. Academic Turmoil tells the story of how the article brought forth student and faculty attacks on Gross as a turncoat and racist, how those who agreed with him kept silent out of fear, and how in the end the college's president, with whom he had maintained a close working relationship, fired him.

Ostensibly this is a story of probity and lonely courage. "It is always safer to remain silent," Gross moralizes about others. But there is little in Academic Turmoil to offend anyone—certainly nothing that could threaten Gross's dismissal by the president of Pennsylvania State University, where he is now the provost. On the contrary, without explicitly admitting it, his book takes back much of what he wrote

Peter Shaw is writing a book on the decline of critical standards.